



## SYMPOSIUM ABSTRACTS

### **The Islamic Educational Institutions Movement in West Sumatra**

Dina Afrianty

The number of Islamic educational institutions in West Sumatra has been consistently increasing over the last few decades. Previously, most Islamic educational institutions represented the traditionalist and modernist sectors such as *Pesantren Thawalib* and *Pesantren Tharbiyah Islamiyah* respectively. At the end of the twentieth century, a new type of Islamic educational institution has emerged which exposes students to secular as well as religious teachings. It can be argued that the majority of these new institutions have no historical or ideological roots within the modernist or the traditionalist institutions. However, their curriculum may still be inspired by the modernist sector. They are commonly known as *neo-salafi pesantren*. Their attempts to be neutral and independent are motivated by their objective of keeping the continuing disputes between the traditionalists and the modernists away from education. Their aim is to produce modern Muslim intellectuals who are qualified in all fields of education and knowledge while at the same time maintaining their strong Islamic identity.

Based on my research I argue that neither the traditionalist nor the modernist Islamic educational institutions responded adequately to the socio-economic and political changes at the local, national and international level. Consequently, they have failed to reformulate and restructure their educational systems. To a certain extent, modernisation and development in West Sumatra has altered the socio, economic and religious values of the *Minangkabau people*. On the one hand people are becoming more materialistic, while on the other they are still conscious of the need to gain and preserve their religiosity. As a result, people who are economically weak become more reluctant to send their children to old *madrasah* or *pesantren*. They argue that these institutions will not be able to equip their children with the appropriate skills needed to gain economic benefits. Meanwhile, middle class families demand new Islamic educational institutions to offer not only religious but also secular knowledge.

## **Gender Mainstreaming in Islamic Primary Schools in South Sulawesi**

Siti Azisah

The Indonesian government has made a strong commitment to the elimination of gender discrimination. Former President Abdurrahman Wahid issued Presidential Instruction No. 9/2000 to promote gender mainstreaming and greater gender equality and equity. This paper will investigate the extent and the manner in which the Indonesian government has implemented the policy of gender mainstreaming in Islamic primary school education. Three well-established Islamic primary schools – one state school and two private schools in South Sulawesi – were the main focus for data collection. My primary contention is that the Indonesian government has made a great effort to support gender mainstreaming in education, by adopting competency based curriculum and campaigning for the publication of gender neutral textbooks. It has also trained school teachers in gender awareness. The content of primary textbooks and teaching practices in these three schools were analysed for gender bias. Teaching practices and the nature and the extent to which gender bias is still apparent in these texts will be the focus of this paper.

## Competency Study of Madrasah Islamic Teachers in Jakarta

Bahris

This paper is the result of research conducted on the competency levels of *madrasah* teachers in Jakarta. The objectives of this research are to get factual information on the Jakarta District Administration's (Pemda) *madrasah* policy, to explore *madrasah* education quality in Jakarta, and to find out the competency levels of *madrasah* teachers (professional, individual, and social competency) in the district of Jakarta. The Jakarta district was chosen as the research area because Jakarta is viewed as being the barometer of education quality for other provinces in Indonesia.

Teacher competency is of particular importance in this research, because the role of teachers in the process of teaching and learning is essential in improving student quality. Based on Indonesian law (UU) No.14/2005, teachers and lecturers, including those within *madrasah*, should have academic qualifications and professional educational competency. Based on MoRA's data, 49% of *madrasah* teachers were inadequately qualified, from Islamic Elementary School (Ibtidaiyah) level up to Islamic Senior High School (Aliyah) level, and 60% of *madrasah* teachers were inappropriately placed and of low quality. In this research, survey methodology was used to obtain qualitative and quantitative data and at the time, those surveyed were all registered Islamic teachers (PAI) of state and private *madrasah* in Jakarta (MI, MTs, dan MA). A competency test was performed on all Islamic teachers (PAI) by way of questionnaire or checklist.

The results obtained from this research correlate with previous research outcomes which indicate that the competency levels of Islamic teachers in *madrasah* are still below standard and have not improved significantly. Consequently, the District Administration (Pemda) is expected to look seriously into this matter. The low competency level of teachers influences the quality of *madrasah* students' ability to learn, as indicated by low student achievement in Islamic studies subjects. It is hoped that information and data obtained from this research will bring this very important matter to the attention of others, so that educational standards within the community can be improved.

## **Gender Issues in Contemporary Islamic Basic Education in Indonesia**

Siti Ruhaini Dzuhayatin

In this paper I will discuss how gender has been taught in Islamic schools. In what subjects is gender taught? What are the references used in the classes? Are gender issues which are taught in school securing the traditional patriarchal values or, alternatively, supporting the gender equality which is widely promoted by many agencies in Indonesia? What sort of initiatives are being developed to improve the sensitivity of teachers in order to mainstream gender in the curriculum of Islamic schools in Indonesia?

## **The Philanthropic Tradition of *Pesantren***

Amelia Fauzia

*Pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) are one of the main Islamic philanthropic institutions in Indonesia. *Pesantren* represent the strength of the Islamic philanthropic tradition of Indonesia, functioning as both philanthropic organisations and beneficiaries of donations. They have survived for centuries on local community resources, most of which come from Islamic charitable and philanthropic activities, usually from *zakat* (almsgiving), *sedekah* (voluntary giving) and *waqf* (religious endowments).

This paper focuses on the philanthropic tradition of *pesantren*, and on how their charitable activities are theologically, politically, and culturally institutionalised. The philanthropic activities and resources management of *pesantren* can be differentiated into two types: “the modern” and “the traditional”. While modern *pesantren* rely on modern organisations to manage their charities, traditional *pesantren* continue to depend on *kyai* (Islamic religious leader) authority in managing charities. Although many *pesantren* have transformed themselves into modern and elite schools, their charitable tradition remains.

This paper argues that the practice of philanthropy at *pesantren* is mainly traditional and not well managed. However, this practice has sustained and financed *pesantren* throughout the centuries, mostly because of the spirit of religious giving and volunteering of both *pesantren* and Muslim communities. Consequently, *pesantren* have become unique Indonesian educational and philanthropic institutions.

## **Religious Education to Protect the Young: Special Qur'an Programmes for Padang (West Sumatra) Schools**

Professor Virginia Hooker

President Soeharto's New Order government was characterised by centralised control (including the use of repression and state-sanctioned violence), medium- and long-term blue prints for development, and an ideology of national unity which papered over the diversity for which Indonesia is famed.

Since the demise of Soeharto's regime, control from the centre has been balanced by greater power for local government in the provinces, extending to municipal and village level. Symbolic expressions of the real shift in power have been developed and are still being negotiated between social and religious groups. The province of West Sumatra is a rich site for studying the ebb and flow of power and interest symbolised by the two elements which the majority ethnic group, the Minangkabau people, see as the essential parts of their everyday life: tradition (*adat*) and religion (Islam) and their implementers the *adat* leaders and the *ulama* or religious scholars.

The struggle for political and economic power at the various administrative levels of the province of West Sumatra is being described in terms of these elements and their success or failure to protect traditional Minangkabau values from erosion. The behaviour of children and young people is interpreted as symptomatic of the health of society in general. So great was his concern with the decline in public morality (so he claimed), that the current Mayor of Padang has introduced a range of new programmes for schoolchildren to ensure that by the time they complete their schooling, they will be able to recite the Qur'an. This is the knowledge, he believes, that is needed to protect the young from moral decadence and thus restore and preserve the traditional values of Minangkabau society.

The paper will examine the programmes and analyse their intention, aims and method and the wider response to their introduction. The administration of the programmes reveals that there is confusion about where responsibility for religious education lies, who has the power to set curricula, and what responses are being developed by individuals whose views differ from those of the Mayor.

**Modern Pesantren Immim:  
A Case Study of a Male Islamic Boarding School in Makassar, South Sulawesi**

Nurul Ilmi Idrus

The S11 tragedy in the USA has had a broad impact on Muslim societies around the world, including in Indonesia. In recent years devout Muslims have often been identified with terrorism in Indonesia because the terrorist attacks in Indonesia have been carried out by former students of various *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools).

As a result of this association between terrorism and *pesantren*, some parents have been reluctant to enroll their children in Islamic schools, for fear that they may be trained in anti-western ideas and join terrorist cells. In reality, most *pesantren* in Indonesia are not fundamental and strongly condemn terrorist activities committed in the name of Islam. To demonstrate this point I will draw upon research conducted in *pesantren* in Makassar, South Sulawesi.

Initially, the paper discusses how *pesantren* have still been able to attract and maintain students in the face of global suspicion of Islam. This discussion is situated within a discussion on how Islamic school curricula compare with public school curricula in Indonesia. Finally, the reason why Islamic schools are still a popular choice for parents and students will be demonstrated by exploring *santri* (student of an Islamic seminary) everyday life experiences, how they are trained, how they manage living away from their parents, and what their future hopes and aspirations are.

## **Islamic education in Indonesia: past, present and future**

Elisabeth Jackson

The paper begins by describing the current state of Islamic education in Indonesia: its institutions and student body, government responsibility for Islamic education and recent legislation regulating Islamic schools, as well as some of the key challenges that Islamic schools face in providing educational services. It then discusses the historical place and role of Islamic education in Indonesia, demonstrating the ways in which this history has shaped the current nature of Islamic schooling. This is followed by an examination of the place and role of Islamic education in contemporary Indonesia, using recent literature which focuses on the negotiation of modernity and tradition in Islamic schools. This literature shows that Islamic educational institutions have traditionally been, and continue to be, adaptable and open to change in terms of their educational philosophy, pedagogy and curriculum. This openness has enabled these institutions to prosper in an ever-changing society. The paper concludes by raising some questions about the future role of Indonesia's Islamic schools, in particular, the ways in which these schools will respond to the discourses of democratisation and globalisation.

**The Emission of power:  
*Pesantren* and political recruitment in Sumenep  
in post-New Order Indonesia**

Abdul Gaffar Karim

Since 1999, *pesantren* in Sumenep have transformed themselves into dominant political agencies. They seem to have dominated local political recruitment, and effectively controlled the 2000 and 2005 District Head (*bupati*) elections. This political role is carried out by supplying political candidates, both through political parties with strong linkages to *pesantren*, and directly to public positions. The candidates are normally people from the *pesantren* inner circle, i.e. the *kyai* and their immediate family members. This process may best be described as the emission of politician candidates.

*Pesantren* have exerted control over the political recruitment process by making principal decisions about which candidate is to be supported, leaving modern political institutions such as political parties in a relatively passive position. Initiatives for recruitment for the top political positions in Sumenep since 1999 have come from senior *kyai* in the bigger *pesantren*. The current Bupati of Sumenep and a majority of the members of parliament, including the speaker, were recruited through this process.

In 1999, PKB, an NU-based party, took over Golkar's previous domination of the local council, and ushered in the *kyai* to important political positions. In 2000, Kyai Ramdhan Siradj, the chairperson of NU that was supported by the majority of *pesantren*, was elected Bupati by the local council, the speaker of which was leader of PKB, Kyai Busyro Karim. In 2005, this turned into conflict over public positions amongst the *pesantren*-related politicians. The then PKB-supported incumbent had to find new political support from PPP (yet another *pesantren*-related and NU-dominated party) when PKB decided to nominate Busyro in the direct mayoral election. *Pesantren* were eventually split into two: some supported Busyro, and many others supported Ramdhan, who won the election.

## ***Kitab kuning, Islamic participation and the pesantren economy***

Julian Millie

Studies of *kitab kuning* – the Arabic textual materials forming the core curricula for many of Indonesia's *pesantren* – have focussed on the content of the texts and the religious affiliations implied by this content (esp. Van Bruinessen 1991). What is less known in the literature on Indonesian Islam is the importance of the *kitab kuning* to the social and economic functions of the *pesantren*. This paper is underlined by the premise that understandings given to the *kitab kuning* are central to the value and importance Indonesian Muslims give to the institution of the *pesantren*.

The paper will discuss how activities revolving around the *kitab kuning* draw involvement from the wider community, serving as a means for consolidating the authoritative position of the *pesantren* as a centre of Islamic activity as well as raising revenues.

While performing research in a *pesantren* on Bandung's northern fringe, Julian Millie was a weekly participant at a routine event held at the *pesantren* in which *kitab kuning* played a pivotal role. The event, labelled *Majelis Istighotsah Ukkayasyah bin Mihshon*, consisted of a group supplication (*istighotsah*) followed by study of a *kitab kuning* text. It drew attendance based on varying understandings of the value of the activity. The audience included aspiring scholars desiring to further their studies. They attended with a copy of the book and a pen. Yet many attended with little interest in the content of the text being interpreted. These perceive the study session as beneficial from a spiritual point of view. Many attended out of respect and admiration for the *kiyai*. These participants consider that listening to his mediation of the text while smoking and chatting is beneficial; it is understood as participation in a worthwhile activity.

The event forms an important part of the *pesantren's* revenue raising activities, with all those in attendance contributing money to a collection box circulated throughout the audience. To take advantage of the revenue potential, the *pesantren* has 'branded' the *Majelis* by developing it as an institution independent from the name of the *pesantren*, and has produced jackets and promotional materials which participants are able to purchase.

In this way, the *kitab kuning* attracts participation from Muslims with varying understandings of the process of exegesis. The actual content of the text plays a varying role in these understandings. Furthermore, the participation in the exegesis of *kitab kuning* constitutes a revenue-raising opportunity for the *pesantren*.

The presentation will include video footage of the *Majelis Istighotsah*.

## ***Pesantren* Education: The Problem of Intersubjectivity**

M Husni Muadz

Islamic education is concerned not only with the training of the mind and the transmission of knowledge (*ta`lim*) but also with the education of the whole being (*tarbiyah*). The teacher is therefore not only a *muallim*, a ‘transmitter of knowledge’ but also a *murabbi*, a ‘trainer and a model of spiritual and moral characters’. According to the Islamic perspective, knowledge (religious or secular) is not an end in itself; it is one of the prerequisites to acquiring a good character. Ideally, the Islamic educational system never divorced the training of the mind from the teaching of morality and spirituality. The translation of this ideal into *pesantren* education, however, always appears to be problematic. In traditional *pesantren*, where students would come to their teachers, often travelling from place to place, students were required to be specialists in the classic disciplines studied through Arabic – Qur’an, Qur’anic recitation and interpretation (*tafsir*), *hadith*, jurisprudence (*fiqh*), and ancillary sciences like logic (*manthiq*), rhetoric (*balaghah*), and grammar – but the approach to these disciplines was mostly intellectual. The non-cognitive aspects of learning were never explicitly addressed. The same is true in modern *pesantren*. The modern *madrasa*, as a formal institution, organized by classes, offering a sequential curriculum, staffed by a paid faculty, and was adopted from or influenced by, modern educational institutions which put heavy emphasis on the intellectual growth of the learners. In the realm of morality, *pesantren* often place most emphasis on teaching moral knowledge, and put less effort into encouraging the affective and behavioral domains of moral feeling and action, which are of great importance in character formation. It seems that there is an implicit assumption that conflates the concepts of knowledge and deeds: knowing is doing and doing is knowing. What the traditional and modern *pesantren* have in common is an overriding emphasis on encouraging a range of ritual and behavioural practices in the vertical dimension, and less emphasis on the horizontal dimension which encourages behavioural practices of mutual acceptance among human beings. What we are witnessing in the *pesantren* then, is the unconscious reduction of the concept and practice of a holistic Islamic system of education – that is, a balanced system of education based on an intellectual understanding of Islamic knowledge and values, and a system of pedagogy designed to practise and conserve those values in the praxis of living.

This paper proposes a conceptual restructuring of the education system in *pesantren* which gives equal priority to practising Islamic values and shows the initial results of our case study of the model in a community setting. We distinguish two kinds of learning: first-order and second-order learning. First-order learning involves a transformation in living together, or how we can live with other human beings with mutual (unconditional) acceptance. This learning is relational and intersubjective. It will be shown that all behavioural change begins with recursive practices of “truthful communication” (with

anyone, anywhere, any time), aiming at intersubjective understanding and truth, and then followed by collective action as a consequence of whatever intersubjective agreement is reached in the communication, if so required. The purpose of this learning is primarily to build and strengthen intersubjectivity, that is, to constantly learn to accept the legitimacy of the other in coexistence with him or herself. Since we cannot avoid meeting and communicating with other people, the first-order learning is unavoidably life-long. The second-order learning is intellectual in nature. It is second-order because cognitive learning (religious or secular) is derived from intersubjectivity. No secondary learning (not even individual existence) is possible without intersubjectivity. To be is to be with. After all, as the Prophet said, “The Qur’an was revealed for the acquisition of good character, not for chanting written chapters”.

## **Islamic Boarding Schools and the ‘Spirit of Education’**

Pam Nilan

Fieldwork conducted in Sulawesi in 2004 indicates that for some young people educated in Islamic boarding schools, it is ‘education’ in itself rather than specific religious education in itself, which comes to be highly valued. Their *pesantren* experiences have created in them a lifelong ‘thirst’ for education. Two Islamic boarding schools, one in Poso, Central Sulawesi (female) and one in Makassar, South Sulawesi (male) teach inclusive curricula – the Indonesian public school syllabus combined with religious curricula from Departemen Agama. Both also equally emphasise Arabic, English and computer studies. The views of the two school principals demonstrate a strong commitment to the ‘spirit of education’ which can carry the most talented and industrious pupils far – even overseas. This ideal is argued to be at the heart of Islam, indicating that in their minds – Islam and the far-reaching ‘spirit of education’ cannot be separated. Yet both of these schools appear extraordinarily poor, not only by western standards, but even by comparison with many Indonesian public schools. The compelling power of the ‘spirit’ of education then, cannot be explained by the provision of quality resources or innovative curricula, but by key aspects of pedagogy and social capital in the boarding school experience.

## **Diverse *Pesantren*, Shared Values?**

Jemma Parsons

Indonesia is home to approximately 15,000 *pesantren*, spanning 33 provinces and currently educating 3.5 million young men and women. No two *pesantren* are identical and the vast spectrum of models that exist accommodates and is a testament to the diversity that characterises Indonesian Islam. This multitude of differing forms is the result of a lack of standardisation. There is a high level of autonomy among *pesantren* to implement educational programs tailored according to the beliefs, needs and wishes of the surrounding community.

The variety of *pesantren* styles and standards begs the question – what influence does the type of institution, its ideology and the values it upholds, have on the development of the attitudes of the students? Do two very different *pesantren* produce two very different types of Muslims? Two *pesantren* in Java sitting on different sides of the spectrum of diverse models, *pesantren* Wahid Hasyim in Yogyakarta and Yayasan Firdaus in Malang, allow a comparative view of *pesantren* models and how this is reflected in the attitudes of their female students. The first part of the paper provides findings based on field research conducted in 2004 in Central and East Java.

While great autonomy and diversity among *pesantren* persists today, a recent initiative by the Centre for the Study of Islam and Society (*Pusat Pengkajian Islam dan Masyarakat – PPIM*) to introduce a standard development model for both *pesantren* and *madrasah*, which includes values education and curriculum development, is important to explore in terms of the impact this may have on the *pesantren* as an institution, and through it, upon the attitudes and values of the *santri* themselves.

## **Muslim Women and Education in Indonesia: *Pesantren* Female Students in Focus**

Eka Srimulyani

*Pesantren* education is known as one form of Islamic ‘traditional’ education in the Indonesian context and is mostly located in Java. *Pesantren* are Islamic boarding school institutions. From an historical point of view, *pesantren* have been known in the archipelago since the 13th century; for Java, *pesantren* can be traced to the 15th-16th century (Mastuhu, 1994). It was not until the beginning of the twentieth century that *pesantren* in Indonesia officially accepted female students. When female students were accepted, *pesantren* education began to be segregated. This segregation is applied to the space where students live as well as within the classroom setting. Some restrictions are also placed on social interaction between the sexes. Moreover, *pesantren* traditions have been said to place limitations on women. In term of having access within the public space, female students face more restrictions compared to their male counterparts. The teaching materials for students have also been criticized for promoting in-egalitarian gender relations. *Pesantren* seem to be a combination of Islamic patriarchal values and Javanese patriarchal values.

In this paper, I will focus more specifically on female students in *pesantren*, to show how religious, moral and feminine values are implanted, and the subsequent effect this has on them. The lives of female students within *pesantren*, the rules they must follow and the gender discourse they must learn, will also be discussed. Their relationship with *nyai* (female leader in a *pesantren*) is also significant in terms of the power and authority it produces. Lastly, I will discuss their personal stories: their motivation, expectations, and future career ideals after *pesantren* education.

## Islamic Education: Facing the Modern World

Suparto

Southeast Asian Islam has been well-positioned to witness the various types of educational institutions in the heart of the Muslim communities in the region. Their roles have been quite significant in spreading literacy, traditional knowledge and an independence of thought to the masses during the colonial era. The existence of these institutions is evidence of a peaceful process of Islamisation in Southeast Asian regions. One of the most popular and reputable Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia is *pesantren*. Indonesian *pesantren* have productively functioned as the centre of *ulama* training, the sanctuary of cultural contestations and the vanguard of Islamic traditions.

Their lasting existence has been recognised by Indonesian Muslim communities long before the introduction of colonial and post-colonial educational systems. Recent phenomenon has shown assiduous leaps made by the *pesantren* in order to catch up with modernity. Some *pesantren* have successfully played instrumental roles in providing educational services for the masses by adopting new types of educational programs. However, this endeavour has not been without consequence, since this has somehow dazed the traditional characteristics of the *pesantren*. This paper sheds light on the strategy of maintaining existence adopted by the two old *pesantren* in Java, namely *Pesantren Buntet* and *Pesantren Kebarongan*. It attempts to investigate some aspects that contribute to the long endurance of these traditional institutions in Indonesia.

## **The Empowerment of Women Muslim Leaders on Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights**

Ninuk Widyantoro

For more than two decades, women's health activists in Indonesia have been trying, via a number of different efforts and strategies, to raise public awareness and knowledge related to women's sexual reproductive health and rights (SRHR). They hope that women will be empowered to improve their health, and to protect themselves from unnecessary mortality and morbidity caused by sexually transmitted infections including HIV/AIDS, threats during pregnancy, childbirth and after, and unsafe abortion.

The Indonesian Government commitment to the plan decided at the International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, 1994, was expected to open opportunities for women, including adolescents, to access SRHR information, education, care and services. Unfortunately, as reported in the Cairo + 5 and Cairo + 10 conferences, there have been no significant changes achieved in terms of the quality of women's health. Indonesian maternal death is still very high and there is only a limited program of information-giving and SRHR education. There are no reliable data on Sexually Transmitted Infections (STIs) and the statistics on HIV/AIDS keep increasing. Now we are already recording babies born with HIV infection. Many women are still ignorant and lack important SRHR information and knowledge.

Since 2001, a number of women's health NGOs have joined forces to develop a law that will protect people's (especially women's and young adolescents') right to access information, care and health services without discrimination. However we still have to face a number of challenges such as the reluctance of decision-makers, the increasing strength of the hard-line Muslim movement, as well as the rigid interpretation of cultural norms and religious teachings about SRHR. Working closely with young female Muslim leaders to improve the overall SRHR situation in Indonesia seems to be opening new hope. In this paper I will share my experiences, methods and strategies in working with these groups.

## **The Role of *Pesantren* in the Development of *Jamaah Dhikr* (Religious Chanting Groups) in Indonesia**

Arif Zamhari

The study of the role of Islamic boarding schools (*pesantren*) in developing *Jamaah Dhikr* (religious chanting groups) is a neglected area of research within the study of *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) and Sufi practices in Indonesia. Whilst there is an abundance of information available on the role of *pesantren* in developing Sufi groups such as *Qadiriyyah*, *Naqshabandiyah*, *Shadhiliyyah*, and *Tijaniyyah*, there has not yet been any comprehensive study devoted to examining the role of *pesantren* in developing *dhikr* groups in an Indonesian Islamic context. This is particularly unfortunate because *dhikr* groups have attracted criticism from some scholars (*ulama*) and Indonesian Muslims, firstly because they are alleged to lack a chain of transmission (i., *silsilah*, A., *isnad*), and secondly because they are regarded as imperfect Sufi practices, and *bid'ah* (an innovation within Islam). This is despite the fact that these *jamaah dhikr* groups, in fact, have the same objectives as those Sufi practices in other established Sufi groups: to obtain closeness to God and his Prophet. Based on my 12 months of field research in three *pesantren* in Kediri, East Java, I will examine the strategies of the Indonesian *pesantren* in developing *Jamaah dhikr* groups and how these groups respond to criticism from other Sufi groups. Furthermore, I will argue that although the *jamaah dhikr* groups are regarded by some as unofficial Sufi groups (*non muktabara*), *bid'ah* and accused of practicing imperfect Sufi practices, members of these groups nonetheless can be seen as operating in the framework of Muslim Sufi mainstream practices.